# THE 19TH-CENTURY POPES ON ST CLEMENT OF ROME IN THEIR OFFICIAL DOCUMENTS

# Martin HUSÁR

Constantine the Philosopher University in Nitra Institute for Research of Constantine and Methodius' Cultural Heritage Štefánikova trieda 67 949 01 Nitra Slovak Republic mhusar@ukf.sk ORCID: 0000-0002-6569-6833 SCOPUS Author ID: 57191329261 WoS Researcher ID: AAG-9365-2020

HUSÁR, Martin. The 19th-Century Popes on St Clement of Rome in Their Official Documents. In Studia Historica Nitriensia, 2024, vol. 28, no. 2, p. 504-521, ISSN 1338-7219, DOI: 10.17846/SHN.2024.28.2.504-521.

The referred topic has not been examined in educational, popular, or scientific literature yet. St Clement of Rome (who was most likely the third in line of succession to St Peter the Apostle) and themes related to him were also discussed in the official documents of the 19th-century Popes, namely in one brief (In Suprimo, 1839) of Pope Gregory XVI (1831 – 1846) and four encyclicals (Grande Munus, 1880; In Plurimus, 1888; Providentissimus Deus, 1893; Satis Cognitum, 1896) of Pope Leo XIII (1878 – 1903). The personality and work of the referred 1st century AD saint have usually been associated with Sts Constantine-Cyril and Methodius who transferred his relics to Rome in 867/868. However, the aforementioned papal documents bring other aspects of St Clement of Rome into the discussion too.

Keywords: St. Clement of Rome; Antiquity; the 19th Century; the Church; Pontiffs;

#### HUSÁR, Martin. Pápeži 19. storočia o sv. Klementovi Rímskom v ich oficiálnych dokumentoch. In Studia Historica Nitriensia, 2024, roč. 28, č. 2, s. 504-521, ISSN 1338-7219, DOI: 10.17846/ SHN.2024.28.2.504-521.

Zmienená téma nebola dosiaľ ešte pertraktovaná v edukačnej, populárnej i vedeckej literatúre. Sv. Klement Rímsky (ktorý bol najpravdepodobnejšie tretím v poradí nasledovníkov sv. Petra Apoštola) a témy s ním spojené boli tiež preberané v oficiálnych dokumentoch pápežov 19. storočia, menovite v jednom liste (In Suprimo, 1839) pápeža Gregora XVI. (1831 – 1846) a v štyroch encyklikách (Grande Munus, 1880; In Plurimus, 1888; Providentissimus Deus, 1893; Satis Cognitum, 1896) pápeža Leva XIII. (1878 – 1903). Osobnosť a dielo tohto svätca z 1. storočia po Kr. boli obyčajne spájané so sv. Konštantínom-Cyrilom a Metodom, ktorí preniesli jeho relikvie do Ríma v roku 867/868. Vyššie spomínané pápežské dokumenty však prinášajú do diskusie aj iné aspekty sv. Klementa Rímskeho.

Kľúčové slová: Sv. Klement Rímsky, Antika, 19. storočie, Cirkev, Pápeži;

/504/

#### I. Introduction

## I. 1. The Referred Topic and Its Reflection

St Clement of Rome and his relics were significant subjects of the Cyrillo-Methodian Mission. In the Life of Methodius one can read a passage that Pope Hadrian II (867 – 872) sent a letter to Duke Kocel' (861 – 876) in 869 where he mentioned that Constantine the Philosopher (St Constantine-Cyril) began his missionary work in Great Moravia by God's grace and with prayers of St Clement.<sup>1</sup> The Moravian Byzantologist František Dvorník (1893 – 1975) even expressed the opinion that St Constantine-Cyril considered St Clement of Rome to be the patron saint of his mission to (Great) Moravia.<sup>2</sup>

The subject under discussion has not been analysed and synthesised in scientific, popular, or educational literature in the following way thus far. It is commonly acknowledged in literature that this saint is mainly associated with the mission and legacy of Sts Constantine-Cyril and Methodius, who discovered<sup>3</sup> and transferred his relics to Constantinople, Great Moravia, and Rome of the Popes between the years 860/861 and 867/868. St Clement of Rome has also been deemed to be the first or third successor to the See of St Peter.<sup>4</sup> In addition, there are discussions on his character, message, and veneration, which are predominantly based on his First and Second Letters to the Corinthians, the Pseudo-Clementines/Pseudo-Clementine writings<sup>5</sup>, and a range of hagiographic texts about him.<sup>6</sup>

On one hand I have already conducted research into part<sup>7</sup> of the referred topic recently. It concerned St Clement of Rome in the official documents of the 20th-century Popes.<sup>8</sup> On the other hand this scientific article did not address aspects that I cover with the present paper.<sup>9</sup> In addition, in the present paper I contrast, where possible, the themes analysed against the background of the (Catholic) Church in Antiquity and the 19th century.

The following publications, for example, are closest to the above-mentioned parts of the referred topic: St Clement of Rome, the Papacy and the 19th century. In the 19th century, Fr Joseph Mullooly (1812 – 1880; a Roman Catholic priest

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> ŽMAM. Žitije Mefodija, archijepiskopa Moravъska VIII. In BARTOŇKOVÁ, Dagmar – VEČERKA, Radoslav (eds.). Magnae Moraviae Fontes Historici II. Praha, p. 129.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> DVORNIK, Francis. Byzantine Missions among the Slavs. SS. Constantine-Cyril and Methodius. New Brunswick – New Jersey 1970, p. 135.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> In Cherson, Crimea.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> HUSÁR, Martin. St Clement of Rome and Reflection on His Personality, Work and Time in the Documents of the 20th-Century Popes. In Konštantínove listy [Constantine's Letters], 2023, vol. 16, no. 2, p. 166-167.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Two letters to Virgins, the Homilies, Recognitions, and Epitomes.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> See more topical literature on these issues in HUSÁR, St Clement of Rome, p. 163-164.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> The unity of the Church, the martyrdom of St Clement of Rome in Crimea and the Basilica of St Clement in Rome – the burial place of St Constantine-Cyril. HUSÁR, Martin. St Clement of Rome, p. 167-171, 173-176.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> HUSÁR, St Clement of Rome, p. 163-185.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> A disciple of the Apostles, Apostolic Succession and the liberation from slavery.

Studia Historica Nitriensia 2024/ročník 28/č. 2

from Ireland) wrote a book called "*Saint Clement, Pope and Martyr, and His Basilica in Rome*" (1873). It was dedicated, apart from St Clement of Rome, to his excavations of the Lower Church of the Basilica of St Clement in Rome during the pontificate of Pius IX.<sup>10</sup>

The four Popes of the last two thirds of the 19th century and the beginning of the 20th century – Pope Gregory XVI, Pius IX, Leo XIII and Pius X – and their pontificates were thoroughly described by Professor Owen Chadwick (1916 – 2015; an Anglican priest from England) in his monograph entitled "A History of the Popes, 1830 – 1914". It was initially published in 1998.<sup>11</sup>

In 2019<sup>12</sup> and 2020<sup>13</sup> Professors Peter Ivanič a Martin Hetényi (current Slovak historians) researched the background of the Encyclical Grande Munus (1880) of Pontiff Leo XIII and responses as well as thanks for it from the Slovak and Czech Catholics.

## II. The 19th Century and the Papacy

In the 19th century, the papacy experienced enormous pressure on its nature and structures from states of Europe (and the world), which were becoming increasingly secularised and atheist. The members of the (Catholic) Church and her centre in Rome have increasingly and seriously been silenced or even persecuted since the Early Modern Period again.<sup>14</sup>

Even before the dawn of the 19th century Pope Clement XIV (1769 – 1774) was literally forced by the (formally) Catholic powers of Europe (mainly by France, Portugal, Spain, Naples and Austria) to suppress the Society of Jesus (which was loyal to the Popes) by the Bull Dominus ac Redemptor Noster (the 16th of August 1773).<sup>15</sup> In particular, the Jansenists, Gallicans and philosophers campaigned against the Jesuits in France,<sup>16</sup> because they were assumed to be the Papal agents and defenders of the Catholic doctrine.

Then Pope Pius VI (1775 – 1799) experienced the occupation of the Papal States by revolutionary France and the foundation of the first early modern as well as non-ecclesiastical Roman Republic (1798 – 1799). The Pope finally died in custody

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> MULLOOLY, Joseph. Saint Clement, Pope and Martyr, and His Basilica in Rome. Rome 1873.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> CHADWICK, Owen. A History of the Popes, 1830 – 1914. Oxford 2002.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> IVANIČ, Peter. The Encyclical Grande Munus and a Response to It From the Slovak Catholics [Encyklika Grande Munus a jej odozva u slovenských katolíkov]. In Konštantínove listy [Constantine's Letters], 2019, vol. 12, no. 2, p. 98-106.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> HETÉNYI, Martin – IVANIČ, Peter. Reflexia encykliky Grade munus a ďakovnej púte Slovanov do Ríma v slovenských a českých katolíckych kruhoch v 19. storočí. In LETZ, Róbert – JUDÁK, Viliam (eds.). Cyrilo-metodská tradícia ako spájajúci fenomén. Nitra 2020, p. 61-82.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> It was especially in the context of the Protestant Reformation (since the 16th century) and the subsequent Counter-Reformation in Europe, when both Catholics and Protestants engaged in mutual confrontations.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> MAXWELL-STUART, P. G. Chronicle of the Popes. The Reign-by-Reign Record of the Papacy from St Peter to the Present. London 1997, p. 210-211; NORWICH, John Julius. Absolute Monarchs. A History of the Papacy. New York 2011, p. 339-340; O'MALLEY, John W. A History of the Popes: from Peter to the Present. Lanham – Boulder – New York – Toronto – Plymouth, UK 2009, p. 225-226. Nevertheless, this society was universally restored in 1814.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> O'MALLEY, A History of the Popes, p. 224-225.

in Valence (France) on the 29th of August 1799.<sup>17</sup> During his captivity in Italy and France (1809 – 1814)<sup>18</sup>, Pope Pius VII (1800 – 1823) managed to avoid the fate of his predecessor and even denounced the rising power of the Bible Societies (some Protestant groups) and Freemasonry.<sup>19</sup>

Pontiff Gregory XVI (1831 – 1846) rearranged (under the Papal command) and supported the missions of the Church and decided to found local Catholic churches in the missions' territory with indigenous clergy.<sup>20</sup>

During the pontificate of Pope Pius IX (1846 – 1878) the gradual seizure of the Papal States by the Italian secular power started as well as was completed. Firstly, the another secular Roman Republic (1849 – 1850) was established in Rome and in the end the French army of Napoleon III captured the Papal capital for the Pope himself in 1850.<sup>21</sup> Before the Kingdom of Italy was proclaimed in 1861, the Papal States lost two-thirds of its territories in 1860, except Latium and its surroundings.<sup>22</sup> Finally, after the leave of the French troops (1870) from the Ecclesiastical State, the power of Pope Pius IX was restricted to the Vatican or the Vatican compound.<sup>23</sup>

The Pope reacted to these calamities by his own means, notably with the Syllabus of Errors (1864) or by summoning of the First Vatican Council (1869). The aforementioned document, which is the last part of the Encyclical Quanta Cura, condemned 80 errors of his time, including atheism, liberalism, socialism, and divorce.<sup>24</sup> The First Vatican Council (1869 – 1870 or 1960) promulgated, among other things, the decree of Papal infallibility – only in the case when speaking ex cathedra on faith and morals.<sup>25</sup>

In addition to these events, Fr Joseph Mullooly with Giovanni Battista de Rossi found and excavated the forgotten Lower Church of the Basilica of St Clement in Rome from 1857 to 1870.<sup>26</sup>

The last Pope of the 19th century, Pope Leo XIII (1878 – 1903), more successfully grasped the contemporary trends of the world without rejecting the magisterium of the Catholic Church. That can be seen in its Encyclical Rerum Novarum

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> MAXWELL-STUART, Chronicle of the Popes, p. 212; NORWICH, Absolute Monarchs, p. 345-346; O'MALLEY, A History of the Popes, p. 229.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> O'MALLEY, A History of the Popes, p. 236-237.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> MAXWELL-STUART, Chronicle of the Popes, p. 214.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> It was managed by one instruction of the Congregation for the Propagation of the Faith, Neminem Profecto, on the 23rd of November 1845. TAVEIRNE, Patrick. The European Roots of the Modern Missionary Enterprise. The Nineteenth-Century Religious and Missionary Revivals : Liberal and Socialist Challenges. In Theology Annual, 1993, vol. 13, p. 155-188; MAXWELL-STUART, Chronicle of the Popes, p. 217.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> CHADWICK, A History of the Popes, p. 85-91; MAXWELL-STUART, Chronicle of the Popes, p. 218; O'MALLEY, A History of the Popes, p. 243.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> O'MALLEY, A History of the Popes, p. 246.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> CHADWICK, A History of the Popes, p. 226-228; MAXWELL-STUART, Chronicle of the Popes, p.218; O'MALLEY, A History of the Popes, p. 248-249.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> MAXWELL-STUART, Chronicle of the Popes, p. 219; O'MALLEY, A History of the Popes, p. 245.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> CHADWICK, A History of the Popes, p. 542; MAXWELL-STUART, Chronicle of the Popes, p. 219; O'MALLEY, A History of the Popes, p. 248-249.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> BSC. Basilica of San Clemente. 2024; BOYLE, Leonard. A Short Guide to St. Clement's Rome. Rome 1989, p. 8, 12.

(1891) to which I also pay attention in the following lines of this article.<sup>27</sup> This Pope made the Vatican archives available to all researchers in 1883<sup>28</sup> and re-founded the former observatory at the Vatican in 1891.<sup>29</sup> Leo XIII concluded the 19th century on the See of St Peter. He was still the successor of St. Peter and the Vicar of Christ, and his secular power was declared at his coronation even after the loss of the territory of the Papal States.

During the traditional papal coronation ceremony (on the 20th of March 1878), the second deacon removed his mitre and Cardinal Mertel placed the papal crown, the tiara, on his head with the words, "Accipe thiaram tribus coronis ornatam, et scias te esse Patrem Principum et Regum, Rectorem Orbis, in terra Vicarium Salvatoris Nostri Jesu Christi, cui est honor et gloria in saecula saeculorum."<sup>30</sup> The last time this solemn formula was uttered at the coronation of Pope Paul VI (1963 – 1978), i.e. it was used until the reign of Pope John Paul I (1978). The newly elected Popes were also no longer crowned with a tiara and the cardinal protodeacon placed only a pallium on their shoulders.<sup>31</sup> Hence the Popes ceased to be elected and crowned as powerful secular rulers of their state, now the Vatican City State, and the World. After 1903, the great powers have also slowly lost interest in interfering in the election of the Popes<sup>32</sup>, who had recently become primarily spiritual leaders in increasingly secularised and atheistic societies.

The gradually silenced or suppressed Church (along with her Popes) during the 19th century and later<sup>33</sup> might only have prayed for the secular rulers, leaders, and governments, said Holy Masses, made pilgrimages, personal sacrifices, or done penance for them, or addressed them on various matters. The necessity of prayer for those in positions of authority, without reference to their intentions, behaviour, or political and religious beliefs, was already voiced by prominent authorities of the persecuted Church in the Roman Empire during the 1st century AD. One can already find this need in the First Letter of St Paul to St Timothy<sup>34</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> MAXWELL-STUART, Chronicle of the Popes, p. 220.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> CHADWICK, A History of the Popes, p. 280.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> VO-H. The Vatican Observatory – History [Online]. 2024.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>30</sup> "Accept the tiara adorned with three crowns, and know that you are the Father of the Princes and the Kings, the Ruler of the World, on earth the Vicar of our Savior Jesus Christ, to whom be honour and glory forever and ever." ANONYMOUS. The Coronation of Pope Leo XIII. In The Catholic World, May 1878, vol. XXVII, no. 158, p. 282. [Online]. 1878.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>31</sup> DE MATTEI, Roberto. Druhý Vatikánsky koncil. Doposiaľ nenapísané dejiny. Bratislava 2019, p. 185.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup> CHADWICK, A History of the Popes, p. 336-337.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>33</sup> For example, the persecution of the Christians during the reign of Adolf Hitler and its political party in Germany (1933 – 1945) and the territories occupied by that state, or the persecution during the reign of the Communist parties in the Soviet Union (1922 – 1991) and in the Eastern/ Soviet Bloc (the second half of the 1940s – 1989/1990). In 2024 one out of seven Christians was persecuted worldwide, then one out of five in Africa, and one out of seven in Asia. Three years earlier (2021), only one out of eight Christians around the world was persecuted. LOFT, Philip – ROBINSON, Tim. Religious persecution and the World Watch List 2024. Commons Library Debate Pack, 23 January 2024. House of Commons Library [Online]. 2024.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>34</sup> "First of all, then, I ask that supplications, prayers, petitions, and thanksgivings be offered for everyone, for kings and for all in authority, that we may lead a quiet and tranquil life in all devotion and dignity. This is good and pleasing to God our saviour, who wills everyone to be saved

or in the First letter of St Clement to the Corinthians<sup>35</sup>, which is also discussed in the following lines of this article.

## II. Themes or Aspects That Can Be Related to St Clement of Rome in the Documents of the 19th-Century Pontiffs

Particular themes or aspects of St Clement of Rome and his work might be found in the official documents of two 19th-Century Popes, i.e. in one brief of Pope Gregory XVI and four encyclicals of Pope Leo XIII. They are as follows:

- 1. A Disciple of the Apostles
- 2. The Integrity/Unity of the Church
- 3. Apostolic Succession
- 4. The Martyrdom of St Clement of Rome in Crimea (Tauric Chersonese)
- 5. The Liberation from Slavery
- 6. The Basilica of St Clement in Rome the Burial Place of St Clement of Rome and St Constantine-Cyril

#### **II. 1. Disciple of the Apostles**

The first aspect related to St Clement of Rome is found in Pope Leo XIII's (1878 – 1903) Encyclical Providentissimus Deus (on the 18th of November 1893)<sup>36</sup> in which the Pontiff concerned the study of Holy Scripture.

In this Encyclical St Clement of Rome, along with St Irenaeus of Lyons (circa 140 – 202) and St Polycarp (circa 69 – 155), also proves God's oracles and words in Holy Scripture.<sup>37</sup> Pope Leo XIII quoted chapter 45 of the First Letter of Clement to the Corinthians in this relation. St Clement of Rome stated there that in "... *the holy and true Scriptures... there is nothing unjust or counterfeit written in them.*".<sup>38</sup> Besides, Pontiff Leo XIII stressed that the immediate disciples of the Apostles (including

and to come to knowledge of the truth." CHB. The Catholic Holy Bible – The New American Bible (2002.11.11) – 1 Tim 2:1-4.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>35</sup> "Yes, Master, make your face shine on us in peace, for our own good, that we may be protected by your powerful hand and rescued from our every sin by your exalted arm. And rescue us from those who hate us without cause. Give harmony and peace both to us and to all those who inhabit the earth, just as you gave it to our ancestors when they called upon you in a holy way, in faith and truth; and allow us to be obedient to your all powerful and all virtuous name, and to those who rule and lead us here on earth. You have given them, O Master, the authority to rule through your magnificent and indescribable power, that we may both recognise the glory and honour you have given them and subject ourselves to them, resisting nothing that conforms to your will. Give to them, O Lord, health, peace, harmony, and stability, so that without faltering they may administer the rule that you have given to them. For you, O Master, Heavenly King forever, give humans glory, honour, and authority over the creatures of the earth. O Lord, make their plan conform with what is good and acceptable before you, that when they administer with piety the authority you have given them, in peace and meekness, they may attain your mercy." 1 CLEMENS. Sancti Clementis Romani Ad Corinthios Epistula Prima 60, 3-4; 61, 1-2. In EHR-MAN, Bart D. (ed.) The Apostolic Fathers. 1 Clement, II Clement, Ignatius, Polycarp, Didache. Cambridge (MA) - London 2003, p. 144-146.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>36</sup> LEO XIII. Providentissimus Deus 1, 7, Encyclical, the 18th of November 1893, p. 1, 4.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>37</sup> LEO XIII, Providentissimus Deus 1, p. 1.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>38</sup> 1 CLEMENS, Sancti Clementis 45, 2-3, p. 114-115.

St Clement of Rome, St Ignatius of Antioch and St Polycarp) drew faith, strength and unction from the Word of God.<sup>39</sup>

The immediate disciples of the Apostles can be more or less identified with the Apostolic Fathers who were inspired by teachings and activities of the significant Apostles, like Sts Peter, Paul and John.<sup>40</sup> The Apostles handed them the Treasure of Faith over.<sup>41</sup>

In his chronicle St Hieronymus (died in 420) reported on St Irenaeus of Lyons' observations about St John the Apostle. According to St Irenaeus, this Apostle lived to the time of Emperor Trajan and his disciples were Polycarp of Smyrna, Ignatius of Antioch, and Papias, Bishop of Hieropolis.<sup>42</sup>

If St Clement of Rome was a disciple of someone of the above-mentioned Apostles, he could most likely have been a disciple of St Peter or (even) St Paul in Rome. St Irenaeus of Lyons affirmed that St Clement of Rome, who was the third Bishop of Rome after St Peter (the Apostle), encountered the preaching of the Apostles and communicated with them.<sup>43</sup>

Some important figures of Church History between the 2nd and the 4th/5th centuries even preferred St Clement's direct succession to St Peter. They were Tertullian (circa 160 – 220) in his De Praescriptione Haereticorum<sup>44</sup> and Rufinus of Aquileia (turn of the 4th and 5th centuries) in his Books of Recognitions of St Clement addressed to Bishop Gaudentius.<sup>45</sup>

#### II. 2. The Integrity/Unity of the Church and Apostolic Succession

The second and third themes from the aforementioned list, integrity of/within the Catholic Church and Apostolic Succession, concerning St Clement of Rome can be noticed in the following encyclical of Pope Leo XIII: Satis Cognitum<sup>46</sup> of the 29th of June 1896.

The encyclical is generally connected with the aspect of the unity of the Church. Pope Leo XIII cited the First Letter of St Clement of Rome to Corinth<sup>47</sup> in the place

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>39</sup> LEO XIII, Providentissimus Deus 7, p. 4.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>40</sup> HUSÁR, St Clement of Rome, p. 165; SUCHÁNEK, Drahomír – DRŠKA, Václav. Církevní dějiny. Antika a středověk. Praha 2013, p. 72.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>41</sup> JUDÁK, Viliam. Učebné texty z cirkevných dejín pre študentov diaľkového štúdia. Bratislava 2002, p. 8.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>42</sup> HCH. Hieronymi Chronicon, Romanorum XI, 3. In PEARSE, Roger (ed.). The Chronicle of St. Jerome. Online Edition, p. 275-276; MARTIN, Regis. On the Trail of Ignatius. In Crisis Magazine, 2023, September 2, 2023, p. 2.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>43</sup> AH. Irenaeus. Adversus Haereses III, 3. In MIGNE, J. P. (ed.). Patrologiae Cursus Completus. Series Graeca. Tomus VII. Sanctus Irenaeus, Episcopus Lugdunensis et Martyr. Lutetia, 1857, p. 849-851. The further secondary literature on this topic can be found here: HUSÁR, St Clement of Rome, p. 166.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>44</sup> TLDPH. Tertulliani Liber De Praescriptione Haereticorum XXXII. In DODGSON, C. (ed.). Tertullian. Vol. I. Apologetic and Practical Treatises. Oxford 1857, p. 465.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>45</sup> RECOGNITIONES. Rufini Aquileiensis Presbyteri in S. Clementis Recognitionum Libros. In MI-GNE, J. P. (ed.). Patrologiae Cursus Completus. Series Graeca. S. Clementis, Pontificis Romani, Opera Omnia, Tomus Primus. Lutetia, 1857, p. 1207-1208. For more information on the matter of St. Clement's direct succession to St Peter, see here: HUSÁR, St Clement of Rome, p. 166-167.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>46</sup> LEO XIII. Satis Cognitum, Encyclical 8, the 29th of June 1896, p. 8.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>47</sup> 1 CLEMENS, Sancti Clementis 42, 44, p. 108-111, 112-115.

where the saint had explained Apostolic Succession passed to bishops and deacons. St Clement emphasised that it was not a little sin to remove from their ministries those who had been appointed by the Apostles or bishops.<sup>48</sup>

The Pontiff used the two selected chapters (42 and 45) of St Clement's First Letter in the particular part of his discussed encyclical called *"The Magisterium (or Teaching Authority) of the Church to be Perpetual"*.<sup>49</sup> In this section Pope Leo XIII pointed out to the principle that Jesus Christ appointed, apart from the other Disciples, his Apostles (provided them with various faculties and duties) who then have transferred their teaching authority, faculties and duties to bishops and their successors.<sup>50</sup> They literally uphold the true teaching of Jesus Christ, the Second Person of the Holy Trinity, who also uttered this statement: "*I am the way and the truth and the life. No one comes to the Father except through me.*"<sup>51</sup>

The dogma or doctrine of Apostolic Succession is approved in the Catholic Church as well as Orthodox churches and it means that the living bishops are in "... a direct, uninterrupted line of descent from the Apostles, by virtue of which they possess certain special powers,..."<sup>52</sup>

Apostolic Succession itself in the Catholic Church of the first two centuries AD was already supported, inter alia, by the advice of St Paul to St Timothy in his Second Letter to him or by St Irenaeus of Lyons in his already mentioned work Against Heresies. St Paul give this advice and encouragement to St Timothy: "*So you, my child, be strong in the grace that is in Christ Jesus. And what you heard from me through many witnesses entrust to faithful people who will have the ability to teach others as well."*<sup>53</sup> St Irenaeus wrote that the presbyters and the episcopate, who had succeeded from the Apostles, must be obeyed, because they obtained the undoubted gift of truth.<sup>54</sup>

During his pontificate, Pope Leo XIII invited Orthodox believers and Protestants to be reunified with the Catholic Church, although in vain.<sup>55</sup> Besides his Encyclical Satis Cognitum in 1896 (concerning the unity of the Church), he reinstated diplomatic connection with Russia and organised conference in Rome (in 1894) to examine the unification of the Eastern and Western Churches.<sup>56</sup> Pope Leo XIII called for unity between the Catholic/Roman Church and the Eastern Churches in his Encyclical Orientalium Dignitas<sup>57</sup> of the 30th of November 1894

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>48</sup> 1 CLEMENS, Sancti Clementis 44, p. 113-114.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>49</sup> LEO XIII, Satis Cognitum 8, p. 6-8.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>50</sup> LEO XIII, Satis Cognitum 8, p. 6-8.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>51</sup> CHB, The Catholic Holy Bible – John 14:6.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>52</sup> NORWICH, Absolute Monarchs, p. 14-15.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>53</sup> CHB, The Catholic Holy Bible – 2 Tim 2:2.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>54</sup> AH, Irenaeus. Adversus Haereses IV, 26: 2, p. 1053-1054. BUTLER, Scott – COLLORAFI, John. Keys Over the Christian World. Evidence for Papal Authority [33 A.D.- 800 A.D.] from Original Ancient Latin, Greek, Chaldean, Syriac, Armenian, Coptic and Ethiopian Documents. Second Edition. State Lane (PA) 2022, p. 8.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>55</sup> MAXWELL-STUART, Chronicle of the Popes, p. 221.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>56</sup> SALMOND, Charles Adamson. The Popes of the Nineteenth Century. London 1900, p. 37.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>57</sup> LEO P. XIII. Orientalium Dignitas, Litterae encyclicae, millesimo octingentesimo nonagesimo quarto (1894), pridie calendas decembres (the 30th of November), p. 1-6.

and he underlined "... the magnificent association of the Slavic nation and the Roman Church,..." in his Encyclical Grande Munus<sup>58</sup> of the 30th of September 1880.

## II. 3. The Martyrdom of St Clement of Rome in Crimea and His Basilica in Rome

Pope Leo XIII concerned with the fourth and sixth aspects from the list mentioned above in his Encyclical Grande Munus dated on the 30th of September 1880.<sup>59</sup> The encyclical was composed on the subject of Sts Cyril and Methodius, the missionaries of the Slavs, and their merits. The Pope also decreed here that their feast day should annually be celebrated in the Roman Catholic Church on the 5th of July.<sup>60</sup> Leo XIII mentioned the discovery of the remains of martyred St Clement in Tauric Chersonesos by order of Roman Emperor Trajan. In the end, St Clement was transferred to Rome and buried in the same church as one of the Salonica Brothers, St Constantine-Cyril, right in the Basilica of St Clement in Rome.<sup>61</sup>

The location of St Clement's relics in Cherson was described by St Constantine-Cyril before his passing. What has remained about this story is called the Kherson Legend<sup>62</sup> that was dated at the turn of the Middle Ages and the Early Modern Period. Here St Constantine-Cyril stated that St Clement's skeletal remains had been found along the instrument of his martyrdom, a rusty anchor.<sup>63</sup>

The remains of St Clement were then relocated to Rome by the Salonica Brothers, where they were warmly welcomed by Pope Handrian II in 867/868.<sup>64</sup> St Constantine-Cyril died in some monastery of Rome on the 14th of February 869 and was finally interred in the Church (/Basilica) of St Clement.<sup>65</sup> In the present, the plausible relics of this Thessalonian are kept in the altar of the Chapel of St Cyril – within the Upper Church of the Basilica of St Clement. This chapel was built exactly during the reign of Pope Leo XIII in 1882 – 1886.<sup>66</sup>

The probable relics of St (Bishop) Clement of Rome are together with those, which allegedly belonged to St (Bishop) Ignatius of Antioch. Both of them are placed beneath the main altar of the Upper Church of the discussed basilica.<sup>67</sup>

The Basilica of St Clement in Rome was the same spot where Pope Leo XIII had the special three-day celebration (3rd – 5th of July) in honour of Sts Cyril and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>58</sup> LEO XIII. Grande Munus 15, Encyclical, the 30th of September 1880, p. 4.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>59</sup> LEO XIII, Grande Munus 3, 7, 9, p. 2-3.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>60</sup> LEO XIII, Grande Munus 18, p. 6.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>61</sup> LEO XIII, Grande Munus 3, 7, 9, p. 2-3.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>62</sup> CURTA, Florin – WILLIAMSON, Ethan. 2021. Anchor of Faith: the Cult of St. Clement in Eastern Europe (ca. 500 to ca. 1050). In HOLUBEANU, Ionuț (ed.). Proceedings of the International Scientific Conference History and Theology, Constanța (Romania), November 17-18, 2020. Bucharest 2021, p. 26-27. For more on the subject of the martyrdom and the finding of St. Clement's mortal remains, see here: HUSÁR, St. Clement of Rome, p. 169-172.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>63</sup> BUTLER, Thomas. Saint Constantine-Cyril's "Sermon the Translation of the Relics of Saint Clement of Rome". In Cyrillomethodianum, 1993-1994, vol. XVII-XVIII, p. 34.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>64</sup> E.g. VC. Vita Constantini-Cyrilli cum translatione s. Clementis 9. In BARTOŇKOVÁ, Dagmar – VEČERKA, Radoslav (eds.). Magnae Moraviae Fontes Historici II. Praha, 2010, p. 110; ŽKF. Žitije Konstantina Filosofa XVII. In BARTOŇKOVÁ, Dagmar – VEČERKA, Radoslav (eds.). Magnae Moraviae Fontes Historici II. Praha 2010, p. 90.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>65</sup> VC, Vita Constantini-Cyrilli 12, p. 112-113; ŽKF, Žitije Konstantina XVIII, p. 94-95.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>66</sup> BOYLE, A Short Guide, p. 33-34; HUSÁR, St Clement of Rome, p. 175.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>67</sup> BOYLE, A Short Guide, p. 20, 26.

Methodius held in 1881. This event was organised within the great thanksgiving pilgrimage of the Slavic people<sup>68</sup> to Rome (25th of June – 6th of July 1881). The pilgrimage was held mainly in gratitude for the publication of the Encyclical Grande Munus by Pope Leo XIII and was also attended by about 250 pilgrims from present-day Bohemia, Moravia and Slovakia (out of a total of 1400 pilgrims).<sup>69</sup>

## II. 4. The Liberation from Slavery

The fifth theme related to St Clement of Rome is *"the Liberation from Slavery"*. Both Popes of the 19th century I have covered in this regard – Gregory XVI and Leo XIII – issued their documents on this subject. Both of them denounced and condemned slavery. They also used chapter 55 of the First Letter of Clement to the Corinthians to explain how (early) Christians had dealt this problem at the end of the 1st century AD.

Pope Gregory XVI in his Brief In Suprimo (the 3rd of December 1839) condemned the slave trade in the Blacks (dark-skinned people) and other human beings. He also forbade any ecclesiastic or layman to defend the trafficking of the Blacks as lawful.<sup>70</sup> The supreme pontiff also mentioned St Clement of Rome in this context and stated that his apostolic predecessor Clement I knew the charitable people who spontaneously surrendered themselves to slavery instead of others.<sup>71</sup> This brief carries a clear implication about the condemnation of slavery by Gregory XVI: "… no one in the future dare to…reduce to slavery (in servitutem redigere) the Indians, the Blacks or other such peoples."<sup>72</sup> Nevertheless, important participants of the slave trade, like the Arabs or the Portuguese, did not hear or worry about the Brief of Pope Gregory XVI – In Suprimo.<sup>73</sup>

The Encyclical In Plurimus of Pope Leo XIII was published eight days before the abolition of slavery in Brazil (the 13th of May 1888)<sup>74</sup>, i.e. on the 5th of May 1888, and was dedicated to the Bishops of Brazil.<sup>75</sup> Brazil was the last country in the Americas in this regard.<sup>76</sup> Pope Leo XIII also stated that St Clement praised the Christians who became slaves in exchange for slaves.<sup>77</sup> He added that

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>68</sup> From the Austro-Hungarian Empire, the Russian Empire, the German Empire and the Ottoman Empire. NOLAN, Louis. The Basilica of S. Clemente in Rome. Second Edition. S. Clemente – Roma 1914, p. 252.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>69</sup> IVANIČ, The Encyclical Grande, p. 98, 101-103; NOLAN, The Basilica of S. Clemente, p. 251-258.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>70</sup> GREGORIO XVI. In Suprimo, Breve, il 3 dicembre 1839, p. 1, 3; CHADWICK, A History of the Popes, p. 47; O'MALLEY, A History of the Popes, p. 240.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>71</sup> GREGORIO XVI, In Suprimo, p. 1.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>72</sup> GREGORIO XVI, In Suprimo, p. 1-2; PANZER, Joel S. The Popes and Slavery: Setting the Record Straight. In The Catholic Answer, 1996, January/February 1996, p. 6, 8. Some scholars and clerics did not think so and made mention only of the Pope's condemnation of the slave trade. PANZER, The Popes and Slavery, p. 7-8.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>73</sup> CHADWICK, A History of the Popes, p. 47.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>74</sup> ROYO GUAL, Joan. Brazil takes princess who abolished slavery 135 years ago off her pedestal. In El País International, Río de Janeiro, 2023, May 13, 2023, 20:21 CEST.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>75</sup> LEO XIII. In Plurimus, Encyclical, the 5th of May 1888, p. 1-13.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>76</sup> ROYO GUAL, Brazil takes.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>77</sup> LEO XIII, In Plurimus 12, p. 7.

the Christians at that time were doing an act of manumission – the owners setting their slaves free.<sup>78</sup>

Firstly, in his First Letter to Corinth St Clement of Rome gave some examples that illustrated self-sacrifice of various rulers of the Gentiles and even prominent women or heroines of the Old Testament (Judith and Esther) in favour of their nations.<sup>79</sup> St Clement then extoled many of the contemporary Christians who "... put themselves in prison in order to ransom others; many placed themselves in slavery and fed others with the purchase price they received."<sup>80</sup>

In Antiquity, even the philosophers of the non-Christian world, like Aristotle, believed that slavery was natural and necessary and could not be abolished.<sup>81</sup> Christianity stressed self-sacrifice and Jesus Christ said in this regard the following: *"This is my commandment: love one another as I love you. No one has greater love than this, to lay down one's life for one's friends."* 

One of the corporal works of mercy (the 6th one), which are kept in the Catholic Church and are based on Holy Scripture, is to visit the imprisoned or to ransom the captive. According to chapter 25 of the Gospel of Matthew Jesus Christ himself spoke to his Disciples about the first six corporal works of mercy out of the seven<sup>83</sup> during his speech about his second arrival. He has indirectly asked them (and de facto also other people) to visit and care for him (and de facto also for other people).<sup>84</sup> Jesus completed to them that whatever they would do for the least of these, they would do also for Him.<sup>85</sup>

In the Old Testament Prophet Isaiah offered forms of penance<sup>86</sup> that the Lord have preferred to other. One of them is "… releasing those bound unjustly, untying the thongs of the yoke; Setting free the oppressed, breaking every yoke;…"<sup>87</sup>

In the Catechism of the Council of Trent, which was valid for the Catholics in the 19th century as well, one can miss the complete list of corporal works of mercy. The first six of them are listed in question IX of chapter VIII (within part I) as all the works of true piety according to the Lord and Saviour – Jesus Christ.<sup>88</sup> The fifth and sixth corporal works of mercy are cited<sup>89</sup> together as in paragraph 39 and chapter 25 of the Gospel of Matthew.<sup>90</sup>

<sup>87</sup> CHB, The Catholic Holy Bible – Isaiah 58:6.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>78</sup> LEO XIII, In Plurimus 12, p. 7.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>79</sup> 1 CLEMENS, Sancti Clementis 55: 1, 3-6, p. 130-133.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>80</sup> 1 CLEMENS, Sancti Clementis 55: 2, p. 132-133.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>81</sup> SCHAFF, Philip. History of the Christian Church. Vol. II.: Ante-Nicene Christianity. A.D. 100-325. New York 1922, p. 348.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>82</sup> CHB, The Catholic Holy Bible – John 15:12-13.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>83</sup> The 7th corporal work of mercy – to bury the dead – was included in the list during the Middle Ages. The basis for that is also in the Book of Tobit – CHB, The Catholic Holy Bible – Tobit 1:16-18.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>84</sup> CHB, The Catholic Holy Bible – Matthew 25:36, 39, 43.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>85</sup> CHB, The Catholic Holy Bible – Matthew 25:40, 45.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>86</sup> CHB, The Catholic Holy Bible – Isaiah 58:5-10.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>88</sup> CCT. Catechism of the Council of Trent, Translated into English, I, VIII, Question IX. Dublin 1867, p. 83.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>89</sup> They "…neglected all the works of true piety, who…nor visited him who was sick and in prison." CCT, Catechism of the Council of Trent I, VIII, Question IX, p. 83.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>90</sup> CHB, The Catholic Holy Bible – Matthew 25:39.

The aforementioned catechism also lists kinds of evils from which people desire to be freed and beseech God to be protected against them.<sup>91</sup> Among these calamities it might also be found the following: "... we beg of God... to keep (us) away (from) slavery, imprisonment..."<sup>92</sup>

In the currently valid catechism of the Catholic Church all the corporal works of mercy<sup>93</sup> are listed twice. The fifth and sixth works are presented in this way: *"The corporal works of mercy consist especially in/include..., visiting the sick and imprisoned,..."*<sup>94</sup>

The Christians in the Roman Empire have been inspired by their principles to do manumission<sup>95</sup> and to make no distinction between slaves, freedmen or free.<sup>96</sup> Emperor Constantine I (306 – 337) forbade the branding of slaves on their faces (in 315) and facilitated the release of a slave by demanding only a written document with the signature of his/her slaveholder.<sup>97</sup> Moreover, since St John Chrysostom (second half of the 4th century – the beginning of the 5th century) the Fathers of the Church had advised to do gradual emancipation in the regard of slaves.<sup>98</sup>

Until the 15th century there had been various kinds of slavery in the world. In the 15th – 19th centuries (since the Age of Discovery) racial slavery, especially the slavery of the Indians and the Blacks, had grown into a problem. Between 1435<sup>99</sup> and 1890<sup>100</sup> the Popes issued a large number of documents (for the Bishops and the faithful) that rejected and condemned the slave trade and slavery.<sup>101</sup>

In the Encyclical Catholicae Ecclesiae<sup>102</sup> Pope Leo XIII named several of his predecessors who stood out among the Popes fighting for the abolition of slavery. This list even begins with St Gregory the Great (590 – 604) and Hadrian I (772 – 795).

The abolition of slavery in the world was implemented throughout the 19th and at the beginning of the 20th century. States at that time usually started with the abolition of the slave trade and then continued with the abolition of slavery itself.

Among significant countries, which abolished slavery in this period, were the British Empire (1833 – 1843), Spain (1811), France (1848), Portugal (1858), the USA

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>91</sup> CCT, Catechism of the Council of Trent IV, XVI, Question VII, p. 501.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>92</sup> CCT, Catechism of the Council of Trent IV, XVI, Question VII, p. 501.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>93</sup> Including the seventh one – burying the dead.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>94</sup> CCCH. Catechism of the Catholic Church. Second Edition. Revised in accordance with the official Latin text promulgated by Pope John Paul II. Includes revision of paragraph no. 2267 promulgated by Pope Francis, 2247. Washington, DC 2019, p. 588, 904.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>95</sup> Specifically, those who were slaveholders. From the third century onwards, manumission had been a solemn act, which was in the charge of the clergy. SCHAFF, History of the Christian, p. 353-354.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>96</sup> SCHAFF, History of the Christian, p. 352-353.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>97</sup> SCHAFF, History of the Christian, p. 350.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>98</sup> SCHAFF, History of the Christian, p. 349.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>99</sup> The Bull Sicut Dudum of Pontiff Eugene IV (1431 – 1447) condemning the enslavement of the natives in Canary Islands.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>100</sup> Pope Leo XIII's Encyclical Catholicae Ecclesiae denouncing slavery.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>101</sup> PANZER, The Popes and Slavery, p. 1-3.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>102</sup> LEO XIII. Catholicae Ecclesiae 1, Encyclical, the 20th of November 1890, p. 1.

(1865) and Brazil (1888). Lastly, after the League of Nations abrogated slavery in its Slavery Convention (1926), the United Nations General Assembly issued the Universal Declarations of Human Rights (1948), which prohibited servitude, slavery as well as the slave trade in its Article 4.<sup>103</sup> Today, slavery or its elements, might concern goal 10 and 16 of the 17 of the United Nations' Sustainable<sup>104</sup> Development Goals, namely (to) "Reduce inequality within and among countries"<sup>105</sup> and (to) "Promote peaceful and inclusive societies for sustainable development, provide access to justice for all and build effective, accountable and inclusive institutions at all levels".<sup>106</sup>

In his previously mentioned famous Encyclical Rerum Novarum (On Capital and Labour, the 15th of May 1891)<sup>107</sup> Pontiff Leo XIII also wrote that the small number of very rich men treated the labouring poor little better than in a state of slavery.<sup>108</sup> He continued and noted that under socialism citizens would be subjected to intolerable and hateful slavery.<sup>109</sup> At another paragraph of his encyclical Leo XIII saw working men in galling bondage.<sup>110</sup>

The Encyclical Rerum Novarum decried (alongside exploiters from the ranks of rich or the bourgeoisie<sup>111</sup>) socialism, because it suppressed the right to property,<sup>112</sup> hurt the family<sup>113</sup> and spurred to class warfare.<sup>114</sup> These actions were clearly anti-Catholic.<sup>115</sup> Unlike the socialists, the Church with Jesus Christ has

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>103</sup> CHRONOLOGY. Chronology: Who banned slavery when? In Reuters World, 2007, August 9, 2007 11:10 PM GMT +2 [Online]. 2007.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>104</sup> I can cite the following parts of paragraph 8 in the Encyclical Rerum Novarum of Pope Leo XIII (1878 – 1903) on the subject of sustainability: "The fact that God has given the earth for the use and enjoyment of the whole human race can in no way be a bar to the owning of private property...Moreover, the earth, even though apportioned among private owners, ceases not thereby to minister to the needs of all, inasmuch as there is not one who does not sustain life from what the land produces." LEO XIII. Rerum Novarum 8, Encyclical, the 15th of May 1891, p. 3. The Encyclical Rerum Novarum also inspired the (traditionalist) Catholic Land Movement in the British Isles. McNABB, Vincent. The Catholic Land Movement [Online]. 2024. Among the Catholics organised in this movement (in America since the 1920s) there have been (and still are) the ones who are associated with the pre-1970s Catholic tradition. They (the religious and the laity) would like to be employed in sustainable agriculture or try to establish sustainable homesteads. Moreover, they have added (the factor of) God, His commandments and prohibitions, to their concept of sustainability and have relied on Catholic morals. CHRIS, Mario John. Is There a Catholic Back-to-the-Land Movement? In OUR LADY'S RANCH – Journal, 2023, 7/5/23 [Online]. 2023; CLM. Catholic Land Movement (CLM). In Edelweiss House [Online]. 2024.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>105</sup> UNSDG 10. The United Nations' Sustainable Development Goal 10 [Online]. 2024.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>106</sup> UNSDG 16. The United Nations' Sustainable Development Goal 16 [Online]. 2024.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>107</sup> The encyclical was completed at the time of the already begun second industrial revolution or the second stage of the industrial revolution (it started around the year 1870). Today we are in the stage of the fourth industrial revolution – in the time of digitalisation.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>108</sup> LEO XIII, Rerum Novarum 3, p. 2.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>109</sup> LEO XIII, Rerum Novarum 15, p. 5.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>110</sup> LEO XIII, Rerum Novarum 61, p. 19.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>111</sup> E.g. LEO XIII, Rerum Novarum 20, p. 6-7.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>112</sup> LEO XIII, Rerum Novarum 5, 22, 46, p. 2, 7-8, 15.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>113</sup> The socialists liked to set aside parents and keep children under supervision. LEO XIII, Rerum Novarum 14, p. 5.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>114</sup> LEO XIII, Rerum Novarum 15, 19, p. 5-6.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>115</sup> CHADWICK, A History of the Popes, p. 314-315.

sought to associate class with class.<sup>116</sup> Pope Leo XIII further wrote that workers have right to earn the whole of their wages<sup>117</sup> and it is necessary for the state to intervene in favour of workers to secure their fair wages.<sup>118</sup> The encyclical also admitted that workers had the right to establish trade unions to advocate their interests.<sup>119</sup> In this document the Pope opposed strikes<sup>120</sup>, unlike the leaders of Socialist/Social Democrat trade unions at the time, which would have caused harm to employees and employers and would have created violence among them and against others.<sup>121</sup>

## **III.** Conclusion

The discussed theme of St Clement of Rome and his spiritual heritage in the official documents of the 19th-century Popes has not been analysed and synthesised in scientific, popular or educational literature yet. So far, in scientific literature St Clement of Rome has mainly been treated as the first or third successor to the See of St Peter, the author of two letters to Corinth and probably other writings, and a character of various hagiographic works. Last but not least, St Clement and his relics had been venerated in Crimea (even by pilgrims from Frankish Gaul) at least since the end of the first third of the 6th century. St Clement most likely became the patron saint of the Cyrillo-Methodian mission to Great Moravia and his relics were translated to Rome by Sts Constantine-Cyril and Methodius in 867/868.

There is little doubt that during the 19th century the Papacy experienced enormous pressure on its nature and structures, namely from increasingly secularised and atheist states of Europe and the world. Despite the various defensive initiatives and efforts of the Popes, they lost the territories of the Papal States, except for the Vatican compound, between 1860 and 1870. The Popes became after 1870 only spiritual leaders of the (Catholic) Church (successors of St Peter and the Vicars of Christ), like in the first centuries of the Church. What is more, they also deliberately abandoned their (although formal) secular reign and powers themselves (between 1963 and 1978) by the omission of their coronation with the tiara and the proclamation of their secular superiority over other secular rulers and governments from all over the world.

The First Letter of Clement to the Corinthians also offers spiritual solutions for a time of the gradual ignoring, silencing, or even persecution of the Church and its clergy (including the Popes) during the 19th century and later, especially in the closing prayer of this letter.

Six facets of St Clement of Rome and its work could be found in the official documents of two 19th-century Popes, Pope Gregory XVI (1831 - 1846) and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>116</sup> LEO XIII, Rerum Novarum 21, p. 7.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>117</sup> LEO XIII, Rerum Novarum 43-44, p. 14.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>118</sup> LEO XIII, Rerum Novarum 45, p. 14-15.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>119</sup> LEO XIII, Rerum Novarum 49, 54, p. 15-17; CHADWICK, A History of the Popes, p. 315; O'MALLEY, A History of the Popes, p. 256.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>120</sup> I.e. strikes in general and potential strikes of the Catholic/Christian trade unions.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>121</sup> CHADWICK, A History of the Popes, p. 315-317.

Pope Leo XIII (1878 – 1903): A disciple of the Apostles, the integrity/unity of the Church, Apostolic Succession, the martyrdom of St Clement of Rome in Crimea (Tauric Chersonese), the liberation from slavery, and the Basilica of St Clement in Rome – the burial place of St Clement of Rome and St Constantine-Cyril. The findings of the analysis of the above six aspects are given in the following lines.

St Clement of Rome might most likely have been a disciple of St Peter or (even) St Paul in Rome. Pope Leo XIII identified St Clement of Rome with one of the direct disciples of the Apostles in his Encyclical Providentissimus Deus (1893) too.

Pontiff Leo XIII linked the topic of Apostolic Succession and the integrity/ unity of the Church in his Encyclical Satis Cogitum (1896). St Clement of Rome took a similar position in his First Letter to the Corinthians from the end of the 1st century AD.

The martyrdom of St Clement of Rome and his basilica in Rome may be listed among the topics of the Encyclical Grande Munus (1880) of Pope Leo XIII. The probable relics of the discussed martyr and saint (along with the relics of St Ignatius of Antioch) are deposited bellow the main altar of the Upper Church within the Basilica of St Clement in Rome.

Both discussed Popes (Gregory XVI and Leo XIII) denounced and condemned slavery in their documents (In Suprimo – 1839, In Plurimus – 1888 and Catholicae Ecclesiae – 1890). This issue significantly resonated throughout the 19th century because the great powers were finally abolishing the slavery trade and slavery during this century itself. Thus Gregory XVI and Leo XIII also had an urgent need to support this cause. In the first two documents, which were previously noted, both above-mentioned Popes supported these ideas, inter alia, by chapter 55 of the First Letter of Clement to Corinth. It is also clear that the Popes had rejected (racial) slavery and slave trade even since 1435 to the time of the 19th-century Pontiffs, Gregory XVI and Leo XIII.

Slavery, which can be understood as one of the obstacles to sustainability even according to the United Nations and its Sustainability Goals 10 and 16, was proposed by St Clement of Rome (in Antiquity) to be solved for the Christians through their self-sacrifice and exchange for slaves (the above-mentioned chapter 55 of his First Letter to the Corinthians).

#### List of sources and literature:

#### **Primary sources:**

- 1 CLEMENS. Sancti Clementis Romani Ad Corinthios Epistula Prima. In EHRMAN, Bart D. (ed.) The Apostolic Fathers. 1 Clement, II Clement, Ignatius, Polycarp, Didache. Cambridge (MA) London 2003, p. 34-151.
- AH. Irenaeus. Adversus Haereses. In MIGNE, J. P. (ed.). Patrologiae Cursus Completus. Series Graeca. Tomus VII. Sanctus Irenaeus, Episcopus Lugdunensis et Martyr. Lutetia 1857, p. 433-1224.
- CCCH. Catechism of the Catholic Church. Second Edition. Revised in accordance with the official Latin text promulgated by Pope John Paul II. Includes revision of paragraph no. 2267 promulgated by Pope Francis. Washington, DC 2019. Available on the Internet: <a href="https://www.usccb.org/sites/default/files/flipbooks/catechism/">https://www.usccb.org/sites/default/files/flipbooks/catechism/</a>.

/518/

CCT. Catechism of the Council of Trent, Translated into English. Dublin 1867.

- CHB. The Catholic Holy Bible The New American Bible (2002.11.11), 2002. Available on the Internet: <a href="https://www.vatican.va/archive/ENG0839/\_INDEX.HTM">https://www.vatican.va/archive/ENG0839/\_INDEX.HTM</a>.
- GREGORIO XVI. In Suprimo, Breve, il 3 dicembre 1839, p. 1-3. Available on the Internet: <a href="https://www.vatican.va/content/gregorius-xvi/it/documents/breve-in-supremo-apostolatus-fastigio-3-dicembre-1839.html">https://www.vatican.va/content/gregorius-xvi/it/documents/breve-in-supremo-apostolatus-fastigio-3-dicembre-1839.html</a>.
- HCH. Hieronymi Chronicon. In PEARSE, Roger (ed.). The Chronicle of St. Jerome. Online Edition, 2005. Available on the Internet: <a href="https://www.tertullian.org/fathers/jerome\_chronicle\_00\_eintro.htm">https://www.tertullian.org/fathers/jerome\_chronicle\_00\_eintro.htm</a>; <a href="https://www.tertullian.org/fathers/jerome\_chronicle\_02\_part1">https://www.tertullian.org/fathers/jerome\_chronicle\_02\_part1</a>. <a href="https://www.tertullian.org/fathers/jerome\_chronicle\_02\_part1">https://www.tertullian.org/fathers/jerome\_chronicle\_02\_part1</a>. <a href="https://www.tertullian.org/fathers/jerome\_chronicle\_03\_part2.htm">https://www.tertullian.org/fathers/jerome\_chronicle\_02\_part1</a>. <a href="https://www.tertullian.org/fathers/jerome\_chronicle\_03\_part2.htm">https://www.tertullian.org/fathers/jerome\_chronicle\_03\_part2.htm</a>; <a href="https://www.tertullian.org/fathers/jerome\_chronicle\_04\_latin\_prefaces.htm">https://www.tertullian.org/fathers/jerome\_chronicle\_04\_latin\_prefaces.htm</a>; <a href="https://www.tertullian.org/fathers/jerome\_chronicle\_05\_latin\_part1.htm">https://www.tertullian.org/fathers/jerome\_chronicle\_05\_latin\_part1.htm</a>; <a href="https://www.tertullian.org/fathers/jerome\_chronicle\_06\_latin\_part2.htm">https://www.tertullian.org/fathers/jerome\_chronicle\_06\_latin\_part2.htm</a>; <a href="https://www.tertullian.org/fathers/jerome\_chronicle\_06\_latin\_part2.htm">https://www.tertullian.org/fathers/jerome\_chronicle\_06\_latin\_part2.htm</a>; <a href="https://www.tertullian.org/fathers/jerome\_chronicle\_06\_latin\_part2.htm">https://www.tertullian.org/fathers/jerome\_chronicle\_06\_latin\_part2.htm</a>>.
- LEO XIII. Catholicae Ecclesiae, Encyclical, the 20th of November 1890, p. 1-3. Available on the Internet: <a href="https://www.vatican.va/content/leo-xiii/en/encyclicals/documents/hf\_l-xiii\_enc\_20111890\_catholicae-ecclesiae.html">https://www.vatican.va/content/leo-xiii/en/encyclicals/ documents/hf\_l-xiii\_enc\_20111890\_catholicae-ecclesiae.html</a>>.
- LEO XIII. Grande Munus, Encyclical, the 30th of September 1880, p. 1-6. Available on the Internet: <a href="https://www.vatican.va/content/leo-xiii/en/encyclicals/documents/hf\_l-xiii\_enc\_30091880\_grande-munus.html">https://www.vatican.va/content/leo-xiii/en/encyclicals/documents/hf\_l-xiii\_enc\_30091880\_grande-munus.html</a>>.
- LEO XIII. In Plurimus, Encyclical, the 5th of May 1888, p. 1-13. Available on the Internet: <a href="https://www.vatican.va/content/leo-xiii/en/encyclicals/documents/hf\_l-xiii\_enc\_05051888\_in-plurimis.html">https://www.vatican.va/content/leo-xiii/en/encyclicals/documents/hf\_l-xiii\_enc\_05051888\_in-plurimis.html</a>>.
- LEO XIII. Providentissimus Deus, Encyclical, the 18th of November 1893, p. 1-18. Available on the Internet: <a href="https://www.vatican.va/content/leo-xiii/en/encyclicals/documents/hf\_l-xiii\_enc\_18111893\_providentissimus-deus.html">https://www.vatican.va/content/leo-xiii/en/encyclicals/ documents/hf\_l-xiii\_enc\_18111893\_providentissimus-deus.html</a>.
- LEO XIII. Rerum Novarum, Encyclical, the 15th of May 1891, p. 1-22. Available on the Internet: <a href="https://www.vatican.va/content/leo-xiii/en/encyclicals/documents/">https://www.vatican.va/content/leo-xiii/en/encyclicals/documents/</a> hf\_l-xiii\_enc\_15051891\_rerum-novarum.pdf>.
- LEO XIII. Satis Cognitum, Encyclical, the 29th of June 1896, p. 1-20. Available on the Internet: <a href="https://www.vatican.va/content/leo-xiii/en/encyclicals/documents/hf\_l-xiii\_enc\_29061896\_satis-cognitum.html">https://www.vatican.va/content/leo-xiii/en/encyclicals/documents/hf\_l-xiii\_enc\_29061896\_satis-cognitum.html</a>.
- LEO PP. XIII. Orientalium Dignitas, Litterae encyclicae, millesimo octingentesimo nonagesimo quarto (1894), pridie calendas decembres (the 30th of November), p. 1-6. Available on the Internet: <a href="https://www.vatican.va/content/leo-xiii/la/apost\_letters/">https://www.vatican.va/content/leo-xiii/la/apost\_letters/</a> documents/hf\_l-xiii\_apl\_18941130\_orientalium-dignitas.html>.
- RECOGNITIONES. Rufini Aquileiensis Presbyteri in S. Clementis Recognitionum Libros. In MIGNE, J. P. (ed.). Patrologiae Cursus Completus. Series Graeca. S. Clementis, Pontificis Romani, Opera Omnia, Tomus Primus. Lutetia 1857, p. 1157-1476.
- TLDPH. Tertulliani Liber De Praescriptione Haereticorum. In DODGSON, C. (ed.). Tertullian. Vol. I. Apologetic and Practical Treatises. Oxford 1857, p. 434-499.
- VC. Vita Constantini-Cyrilli cum translatione s. Clementis. In BARTOŇKOVÁ, Dagmar – VEČERKA, Radoslav (eds.). Magnae Moraviae Fontes Historici II. Praha 2010, p. 103-113.
- ŽKF. Žitije Konstantina Filosofa. In BARTOŇKOVÁ, Dagmar VEČERKA, Radoslav (eds.). Magnae Moraviae Fontes Historici II. Praha 2010, p. 43-95.
- ŽMAM. Žitije Mefodija, archijepiskopa Moravьska. In BARTOŇKOVÁ, Dagmar VE-ČERKA, Radoslav (eds.). Magnae Moraviae Fontes Historici II. Praha, p. 116-140.

Studia Historica Nitriensia 2024/ročník 28/č. 2

#### Monographs:

BOYLE, Leonard. A Short Guide to St. Clement's Rome. Rome 1989.

- BUTLER, Scott COLLORAFI, John. Keys Over the Christian World. Evidence for Papal Authority [33 A.D.- 800 A.D.] from Original Ancient Latin, Greek, Chaldean, Syriac, Armenian, Coptic and Ethiopian Documents. Second Edition. State Lane (PA) 2022.
- DE MATTEI, Roberto. Druhý Vatikánsky koncil. Doposiaľ nenapísané dejiny. Bratislava 2019.
- DVORNIK, Francis. Byzantine Missions among the Slavs. SS. Constantine-Cyril and Methodius. New Brunswick; New Jersey 1970.
- CHADWICK, Owen. A History of the Popes, 1830 1914. Oxford 2002.
- JUDÁK, Viliam. Učebné texty z cirkevných dejín pre študentov diaľkového štúdia. Bratislava 2002.
- MAXWELL-STUART, P. G. Chronicle of the Popes. The Reign-by-Reign Record of the Papacy from St Peter to the Present. London 1997.
- MULLOOLY, Joseph. Saint Clement, Pope and Martyr, and His Basilica in Rome. Rome 1873.
- NOLAN, Louis. The Basilica of S. Clemente in Rome. Second Edition. S. Clemente Roma 1914.
- NORWICH, John Julius. Absolute Monarchs. A History of the Papacy. New York 2011.
- O'MALLEY, John W. A History of the Popes: from Peter to the Present. Lanham Boulder – New York – Toronto – Plymouth, UK 2009.
- SALMOND, Charles Adamson. The Popes of the Nineteenth Century. London 1900.
- SCHAFF, Philip. History of the Christian Church. Vol. II.: Ante-Nicene Christianity. A.D. 100-325. New York 1922.
- SUCHÁNEK, Drahomír DRŠKA, Václav. Církevní dějiny. Antika a středověk. Praha 2013.

#### Articles in Journals, Chapter in Monographs:

- BUTLER, Thomas. Saint Constantine-Cyril's "Sermon the Translation of the Relics of Saint Clement of Rome". In Cyrillomethodianum, 1993-1994, vol. XVII-XVIII, p. 15-39.
- CURTA, Florin WILLIAMSON, Ethan. Anchor of Faith: the Cult of St. Clement in Eastern Europe (ca. 500 to ca. 1050). In HOLUBEANU, Ionuț (ed.). Proceedings of the International Scientific Conference History and Theology, Constanța (Romania), November 17-18, 2020. Bucharest 2021, p. 16-54.
- HUSÁR, Martin. St Clement of Rome and Reflection on His Personality, Work and Time in the Documents of the 20th-Century Popes. In Konštantínove listy [Constantine's Letters], 2023, vol. 16, no. 2, p. 163-185.
- HETÉNYI, Martin IVANIČ, Peter. Reflexia encykliky Grade munus a ďakovnej púte Slovanov do Ríma v slovenských a českých katolíckych kruhoch v 19. storočí. In LETZ, Róbert – JUDÁK, Viliam (eds.). Cyrilo-metodská tradícia ako spájajúci fenomén. Nitra 2020, p. 61-82.
- IVANIČ, Peter. The Encyclical Grande Munus and a Response to It From the Slovak Catholics [Encyklika Grande Munus a jej odozva u slovenských katolíkov]. In Konštantínove listy [Constantine's Letters], 2019, vol. 12, no. 2, p. 98-106.
- MARTIN, Regis. On the Trail of Ignatius. In Crisis Magazine, 2023, September 2, 2023, p. 1-3.
- PANZER, Joel S. The Popes and Slavery: Setting the Record Straight. In The Catholic Answer, 1996, January/February 1996, p. 1-12. Available on the Internet: <a href="https://www.ewtn.com/catholicism/library/popes-and-slavery-setting-the-record-straight-1119">https://www.ewtn.com/catholicism/library/popes-and-slavery-setting-the-record-straight-1119</a>>.

/520/

- ROYO GUAL, Joan. Brazil takes princess who abolished slavery 135 years ago off her pedestal. In El País International, Río de Janeiro, 2023, May 13, 2023, 20:21 CEST. Available on the Internet: <a href="https://english.elpais.com/international/2023-05-13/brazil-takes-princess-who-abolished-slavery-135-years-ago-off-her-pedestal.html">https://english.elpais.com/international/2023.05-13/brazil-takes-princess-who-abolished-slavery-135-years-ago-off-her-pedestal.html</a>.
- TAVEIRNE, Patrick. The European Roots of the Modern Missionary Enterprise. The Nineteenth-Century Religious and Missionary Revivals : Liberal and Socialist Challenges. In Theology Annual, 1993, vol. 13, p. 155-188. Available on the Internet: <a href="http://archive/archive/periodical/abstract/A013F2.htm">http://archive/ archive.hsscol.org.hk/Archive/periodical/abstract/A013F2.htm;</a> http://archive. hsscol.org.hk/Archive/periodical/abstract/A013h.htm>.

#### **Internet sources:**

- ANONYMOUS. The Coronation of Pope Leo XIII. In The Catholic World, May 1878, vol. XXVII, no. 158, p. 280-285. [Online]. 1878. Available on the Internet: <a href="https://quod.lib.umich.edu/m/moajrnl/bac8387.0027.158/284:16?rgn=full+text;view=image">https://quod.lib.umich.edu/m/moajrnl/bac8387.0027.158/284:16?rgn=full+text;view=image</a>>.
- BSC. Basilica of San Clemente [Online]. 2024. Available on the Internet: <a href="https://basilicasanclemente.com/eng/">https://basilicasanclemente.com/eng/</a>.
- CHRIS, Mario John. Is There a Catholic Back-to-the-Land Movement? In OUR LADY'S RANCH Journal, 2023, 7/5/23 [Online]. 2023. Available on the Internet: <a href="https://www.ourladysranch.com/journal/entry-25">https://www.ourladysranch.com/journal/entry-25</a>>.
- CHRONOLOGY. Chronology: Who banned slavery when? In Reuters World, 2007, August 9, 2007 11:10 PM GMT +2 [Online]. 2007. Available on the Internet: <a href="https://www.reuters.com/article/idUSEIC168691/">https://www.reuters.com/article/idUSEIC168691/</a>.
- CLM. Catholic Land Movement (CLM). In Edelweiss House [Online]. 2024. Available on the Internet: <a href="https://edelweisshouse.org/catholic-land-movement">https://edelweisshouse.org/catholic-land-movement</a>>.
- LOFT, Philip ROBINSON, Tim. Religious persecution and the World Watch List 2024. Commons Library Debate Pack, 23 January 2024. House of Commons Library 10 [Online]. 2024. Available on the Internet: <a href="https://researchbriefings.files.parliament.uk/documents/CDP-2024-0017/CDP-2024-0017.pdf">https://researchbriefings.files.parliament.uk/ documents/CDP-2024-0017/CDP-2024-0017.pdf</a>.
- McNABB, Vincent. The Catholic Land Movement [Online]. 2024. Available on the Internet: <a href="https://catholiclandmovement.info/about">https://catholiclandmovement.info/about</a>>.
- UNSDG 10. The United Nations' Sustainable Development Goal 10 [Online]. 2024. Available on the Internet: <a href="https://sdgs.un.org/goals/goal10">https://sdgs.un.org/goals/goal10</a>.
- UNSDG 16. The United Nations' Sustainable Development Goal 16 [Online]. 2024. Available on the Internet: <a href="https://sdgs.un.org/goals/goal16">https://sdgs.un.org/goals/goal16</a>>.
- VO-H. The Vatican Observatory History [Online]. 2024. Available on the Internet: <a href="https://www.vaticanobservatory.org/about/history/">https://www.vaticanobservatory.org/about/history/</a>>.

## Acknowledgements

This work was supported by the Slovak Research and Development Agency under the contract No. APVV22-0204 (Religiozita a hodnoty trvalej udržateľnosti/ Religiosity and the values of sustainability).

Word count: 9 063 Number of characters, including spaces: 58 385